21

22

23

. 24

25

26

JEFFREY G. PAUPORE, SBN 007769 STEVE A. YOUNG, SBN016838 Deputy County Attorney YCAO@co.yavapai.az.us 2011 AUG 17 PM 4: 14
SANDRA K MARXHAM. CLERN

Attorneys for STATE OF ARIZONA

IN THE SUPERIOR COURT OF THE STATE OF ARIZONA

IN AND FOR THE COUNTY OF YAVAPAI

STATE OF ARIZONA,

Plaintiff,

- ----

vs.

1

2

3

4

5

6

STEVEN CARROLL DEMOCKER,

Defendant.

CAUSE NO. P1300CR201001325

REPLY RE JAMES KNAPP

Assigned to Hon. Warren R. Darrow Division PTB

The State of Arizona, by and through Sheila Sullivan Polk, Yavapai County Attorney and her deputy Jeffrey Paupore, hereby replies to Defendant's response to the State's Motion in Limine regarding James Knapp.

Defendant's response is disjointed, confusing and completely misses the point of the motion in limine. Defendant wants to present "complete Knapp evidence" but fails to explain how character evidence of a deceased person is legally admissible at trial. Furthermore, the Defendant fails to show how Mr. Knapp's death is relevant to this case.

The State's motion in limine does not attack or even address the third party culpability defense. The motion seeks preclusion of evidence of James Knapp's character and evidence surrounding his death pursuant to Rules 401, 402 403, 404, and 608 of the Arizona Rules of Evidence.

On January 7, 2009 James Knapp was found deceased at his residence located at 3099 Peaks View Court, Prescott, AZ. The incident was investigated by the Prescott Police Department. An autopsy was preformed by Dr. Philip Keen on January 8, 2009. Dr. Keen determined the cause of death was by gunshot wound to the thorax which was self-inflicted and determined the manner of death to be suicide.

Office of the Yavapai County Attorney 255 E. Gurley Street, Suite 300 Prescott, AZ, 86301

1

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

26

771-3110

(878) 11

Facsimile:

Phone: (928) 771-3344

There is no legal basis to allow character evidence of Mr. Knapp's alleged mental state, drug use, desperate search for money, his scams and failed relationships, nor is it relevant on how he died. The only reason Defendant wants the jury hear this evidence is to paint Mr. Knapp as the bad guy and to confuse the jury.

RULE 404. CHARACTER EVIDENCE NOT ADMISSIBLE TO PROVE CONDUCT;

(a) Character evidence generally. Evidence of a person's character is not admissible for the purpose of proving that he acted in conformity therewith on a particular occasion, except: (3) Character of witness. Evidence of the character of a witness, as provided in Rules 607, 608 and 609. (emphasis added).

Rules 607, 608 and 609 allows character evidence for impeachment purposes against a witness who has testified. James Knapp can not testify because he is dead so the exceptions to Rule 404 (a) (3) do not apply to him. The Defendant has not and can not over come Rule 404(a) (3) preclusion of Mr. Knapp's character evidence in this trial.

Character evidence is not admissible to prove the witness acted in conformity with character on a particular occasion. The rationale is that character evidence may be of slight probative value but very prejudicial. It distracts the trier of fact from the central issues in the case and subtly permits rewarding the "good" person and punishing the "bad" person because of their respective characters, despite what the evidence shows actually happened.

Character evidence is inadmissible to prove that a person "acted in conformity therewith on a particular occasion." *State v. Fish*, 222 Ariz. 109, 117, ¶20, 213 P.3d 258,266 (App. 2009); *Ritchie v. Krasner*, 221 Ariz. 288, 211 P.3d 1272 (App. 2009); *State v. Cano*, 154 Ariz. 447, 743 P.2d 956 (App 1987). Under the principles of relevancy, the evidence can not be unfairly prejudicial, cumulative or misleading which are the reasons Defendant wants to bring in Mr. Knapp's character and circumstances of his death.

RULE 401 RELEVANT EVIDENCE

"Relevant evidence" means evidence having any tendency to make the existence of any fact that is of consequence to the determination of the action more probable or less probable than it would be without the evidence.

"If evidence has no probative value, it is inadmissible under Rule 401, without even reaching Rule 403." *State v. Oliver*, 158 Ariz. 22, 28, 760 P.2d 1071, 1077 (1988).

1

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

23

Phone: (928) 771-3344

771-3110

Evidence surrounding his death is not probative of the issues at trial. This evidence is not relevant and therefore inadmissible under the Arizona Rules of Evidence.

CONCLUSION

This Court is moved for an Order precluding character evidence of James R. Knapp, as well as evidence surrounding his death. Evidence of Mr. Knapp's character is inadmissible under any legal theory. Evidence of the death of James Knapp is not relevant to any issue, fact or circumstance in this case.

RESPECTFULLY SUBMITTED this 17th day of August, 2011.

Sheila Sullivan Polk

1

By:

Jeffrey Paupore

Deputy County Altorney

YAVAPAI COUNTY ATTORNEY

COPY of the foregoing **Emailed** this 17th day of August, 2011, to:

Honorable Warren R. Darrow

Division 6

Yavapai County Superior Court

Via email to Diane Troxell: <u>DTroxell@courts.az.gov</u>

Craig Williams

20 Attorney for Defendant

21 Yavapai Law Office

3681 No. Robert Rd.

22 Prescott Valley, AZ 86314

Via email to <u>yavapaiolaw@hotmail.com</u>

Greg Parzych

24 Co-counsel for Defendant

2340 W. Ray Rd., Suite #1

25 Chandler, AZ 85224

via email to: gparzlaw@aol.com

Phone: (928) 771-3344 Facsimile: (928) 771-3110 Office of the Yavapai County Attorney 255 E. Gurley Street, Suite 300 Prescott, AZ 86301

1	John Napper
	634 Schemmer, Ste 102
2	Prescott, AZ 86305
,	Attorney for Renee Girard
3	Via email to johnnapper@cableone.net
4	
	Daniela De La Torre
5	Attorney for victim
_	Charlotte DeMocker
6	245 West Roosevelt, Suite A
7	Phoenix, AZ 85003
	via email to: ddelatorre@azbar.org
8	
	Melody G. Harmon
9	Attorney for victim
10	Katie DeMocker
10	210 S. 4 th Ave., Suite 220
11	Phoenix, AZ 85003
	Via email to mharmonlaw@gmail.com
12	

By: Roubb